SOCIAL INSURANCE vs. PUBLIC ASSISTANCE OVERVIEW

July 16, 2021
QUALIFICATIONS, ASSUMPTIONS AND LIMITING CONDITIONS

Oliver Wyman was commissioned by the California Department of Insurance to provide support associated with assessing the feasibility of developing and implementing a culturally competent statewide insurance program for long-term care services and supports. The primary audience for this report includes stakeholders from the California Department of Insurance, members of the Long-Term Care Insurance Task Force, and members of the general public within the state of California.

Oliver Wyman shall not have any liability to any third party in respect of this report or any actions taken or decisions made as a consequence of the results, advice or recommendations set forth herein.

The opinions expressed herein are valid only for the purpose stated herein and as of the date hereof. Information furnished by others, upon which all or portions of this report are based, is believed to be reliable but has not been verified. No warranty is given as to the accuracy of such information. Public information and industry and statistical data are from sources Oliver Wyman deems to be reliable; however, Oliver Wyman makes no representation as to the accuracy or completeness of such information and has accepted the information without further verification. No responsibility is taken for changes in market conditions or laws or regulations and no obligation is assumed to revise this report to reflect changes, events or conditions, which occur subsequent to the date hereof.
OUR ASK OF LTC TASK FORCE MEMBERS

1. **Read** this document or **watch** the YouTube recording of this presentation

2. **Respond** to our brief questionnaire regarding your (preliminary) recommendations for the program design elements discussed in this document/presentation

3. **Review** summarized questionnaire results prior to upcoming Task Force Meeting

4. **Participate** in group discussions and debates around recommended program design at Task Force Meetings

© Oliver Wyman
Social insurance involves the required pooling of risks among participants; public assistance provides basic economic security to the needy.

**Social Insurance**
- Protection of the individual against economic hazards (such as unemployment, old age, or disability) in which the government participates or enforces the participation of employers and affected individuals.
- Social insurance encompasses broad-based systems that help workers and their families pool risks to avoid loss of income due to retirement, death, disability, or unemployment; and to ensure access to health care.

**Public Assistance**
- Government aid to needy, aged, or disabled persons and to dependent children.
- The purpose of public assistance is to provide at least a minimum degree of economic security to persons in need. Public assistance programs complement other programs for economic security by supplying basic maintenance to needy persons for whom benefits are not available or are insufficient.

---
1. [https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/social%20insurance](https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/social%20insurance)
2. [https://www.nasi.org/about/](https://www.nasi.org/about/) (NASI is the National Academy of Social Insurance)
4. [https://www.ssa.gov/policy/docs/ssb/v7n11/v7n11p2.pdf](https://www.ssa.gov/policy/docs/ssb/v7n11/v7n11p2.pdf) (SSA is the Social Security Administration)
EXAMPLES: SOCIAL INSURANCE
Well-known examples can be used to highlight differences

Definitions

Social Security
- Employees and employers pay into shared fund via payroll tax
- Cash benefits to eligible individuals aged 65 or older and certain disabled individuals

Medicare
- Employees and employers pay into shared fund via payroll tax; also supported by premiums and other taxes
- Health insurance for eligible individuals aged 65 or older
- Covers younger individuals with disabilities and persons with certain diseases

State Unemployment Insurance
- Cash benefits to unemployed individuals (involuntary and looking for work)
- Requirements for eligibility, payroll tax rates, and benefit amounts set at the state level
- Benefit amounts typically subject to individual’s recent wage history, with a low maximum benefit

State Disability Insurance (select states only)
- Only five states (including California) have state-mandated disability insurance programs
- Cash benefits for individuals unable to work due to illness, injury, pregnancy, or childbirth
- Funded by payroll taxes and covers most employees; California employers with better private plans can opt out

Workers’ Compensation Insurance
- Wage replacement and medical benefits to employees injured on the job, as well as vocational rehabilitation
- Premiums paid by employers to insurance companies with rates based on industry and employer experience
EXAMPLES: PUBLIC ASSISTANCE
Well-known examples can be used to highlight differences

---

**Definitions**

**Medi-Cal (California’s Medicaid Program)**
- Eligibility subject to income requirements (and, for some aid categories, asset limits)
- Serves low-income individuals, families, seniors, and disabled individuals

**Children’s Health Insurance Program (CHIP)**
- Provides low-cost health coverage to children
- Eligibility at higher income levels compared to Medi-Cal

**Supplemental Security Income (SSI)**
- Means-tested program
- Provides cash payments to disabled children, disabled adults, and individuals aged 65 or older

**Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP)**
- Formerly known as Food Stamps
- Provides nutrition benefits to supplement food budget of needy families
- Cash-like benefits for purchase of food using an Electronic Benefit Transfer (EBT) card

**Housing Choice Voucher Program**
- Provides housing vouchers for low-income individuals and families
- Eligible individuals and families can put voucher towards rent or, in some instances, use it to purchase a house

**Fuel Assistance Program**
- Helps eligible individuals and families pay heating bills in winter

---

**Examples**

---

**Similarities**

---

**Eligibility**

---

**Financing**

---

**Pros and cons**

---
Examples: Neither Social Insurance Nor Public Assistance

Well-known examples can be used to highlight differences:

Voluntary insurance programs provided by the government
- Includes federal flood insurance and federal crop insurance
- Key reason these programs are not social insurance is that they are voluntary

Benefits administered by the government for current or former employees
- Retirement benefits for local, state, and federal employees (including military veterans)
- Medical benefits for active and retired local, state, and federal employees (including active military and military veterans)
- Persons receiving these benefits can also qualify for both public assistance and social insurance
Role of Government

- Administration is performed or supervised by the government

Laws and Regulation

- Laws and regulations generally affect both programs in similar ways (with separate laws for each)
- Benefits are established by law and can be modified by law
- Changes to tax rates funding these programs can occur
  - For social insurance programs, rate changes are typically infrequent (at least recently)
  - Changes to general taxes are generally driven by more than just the cost of public assistance programs
- Benefit reductions are uncommon (either to eligibility or benefit level), but do occur
ELIGIBILITY
Financial need and participation rates drive differences in eligibility

Social Insurance
• High participation
  – Participation is universally (or almost universally) compulsory for defined population
  – In some cases, contribution is set at such a subsidized rate that vast majority of those eligible choose to participate
• No financial need requirements
  – Eligible individuals can participate regardless of financial need
• Participants have a right to receive benefits
  – Payroll contributions provide legal, moral, and political right to receive benefits
  – Payroll contributions from a worker can provide eligibility for a spouse or other family members
  – Number of claimants for Social Security and Medicare largely driven by population demographics

Public Assistance
• Participation varies
  – Enrollment typically increases when economic conditions worsen and may decline after periods of economic improvement, particularly for employment and wages
• Financial need is required to participate
  – Determined by an individual’s income and/or assets, with an application
• Medical conditions may factor into eligibility
  – Certain medical conditions may allow for eligibility at higher income levels
  – For example, pregnant women are eligible for Medi-Cal up to higher income levels compared to women who are not pregnant
• Participants must show continuing need
  – Annual (or more frequent) redetermination is required to participate
Social Insurance
- Payroll or income-based taxes
  - Made by or on behalf of individual participants
  - Tax rates do not directly account for risk profile of individual participants or their potential benefits
  - Social Security and Medicare (Part A) are mainly funded through payroll taxes
- Trust funds
  - Provide explicit accountability of benefit payments and income
  - Generally used when benefits are likely many years into the future compared to contributions
  - Interest earned on trust fund is a revenue source for benefits and administrative costs
  - Medicare is funded through premiums and taxes, which go into Trust Funds

Public Assistance
- General tax revenues
  - Local, state, and federal taxes
  - Specific taxes are often earmarked (such as taxes on medical providers and managed care organizations)
  - For Medi-Cal, federal government pays a portion of total costs for services that qualify
**Program Administration**

- **Under social insurance construct, California State Disability Insurance Program could be leveraged**
  - California State Disability Insurance ("CSDI") program already tracks employee payroll taxes
  - AB 567 contemplates the long-term care ("LTC") insurance program potentially being:
    - Included as a benefit in CSDI program (possibly though nominal increase in payroll tax)
    - Structured in same manner as Paid Family Leave benefits

- **Under public assistance construct, new eligibility record system would need to be built and maintained**
  - Presumes some record on years of residence in California and some means testing would be required
  - Could be like Medi-Cal, but:
    - At higher income and assets
    - Federal match could be explored through Medi-Cal if expenditures are budget neutral to federal government’s Medicaid budget

**Changes to Benefit Levels**

- **With social insurance, modifying benefits is more difficult (particularly for those already on claim)**
  - LTC initiatives at federal level may provide benefits that are duplicative of California program (in the future)
  - While it is politically difficult to increase premium rates, this has been done more frequently than reducing benefits (for example, for Social Security)

- **With public assistance, reducing benefits is not as difficult**
  - No dedicated payroll taxes makes reductions more feasible, although it may be politically difficult to reduce benefits for those on claim
  - Presumes taxes financing LTC benefits are general state taxes, such that increases would pay for numerous other programs
WHAT NEXT?

Please fill out the questionnaire
We will tally results and distribute them in advance of the next Task Force Meeting!